

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission  
Meeting Minutes

Date: January 16, 2015

Location: City Council Chamber, 1300 Perdido Street, New Orleans, LA

Called to order: 10:00 a.m

Adjourned: 1:50 p.m.

Commissioners present: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting: Jenna Burke

Commissioners absent: Ed deMontluzin, Jeanne Nathan, Katye Fayard

**I. Minutes**

A. Minutes of the December 12, 2014 meeting

Motion: Approve the meeting minutes.

By: Marlene Jaffe

Seconded: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander

Opposed:

Comments:

**II. CONSENT AGENDA**

- A. 3106 St Thomas St: Jonathan Tate, applicant; Renewal Home Limited Partnership, Charles A Jr Rutledge, owner; Construct single-family residence on existing vacant lot.
- B. 2000-2006 Burgundy St, 835 Touro St: Kirk Fabacher, applicant; Fred D Manis, Mgc, LLC, owner; Demolish existing penthouse and construct new penthouse.
- C. 744-748 Pleasant St: Kim Finney, applicant; Willie Carter, owner; General renovation, including demolition of existing addition and construction of new addition, to an existing 3-family residential building.
- D. 1537 S Carrollton Ave, 8034 Birch St: Rick A. Fifield, applicant; Michael A Naglieri, owner; General renovation of accessory structure, including addition of window and door openings and change of materials.
- E. 1609 Governor Nicholls St: Tim Terrell, applicant; Tritex Oak Tree, LLC C/O John M Charles, owner; New construction of a single family residential building.

Motion: Suspend the rules.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander

Opposed:

Motion: Remove items II. A and E from the Consent Agenda

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander

Motion: Reinstate the rules

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

Unanimous: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander

Motion: Approve the Consent Agenda.

By: Dwight Norton

Second: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time, Jenna Burke arrived.

A. 3106 St. Thomas Street

Application: Construct single family residence on existing vacant lot.

Motion: Grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the recommendations of the ARC and the details to be worked out with ARC and Staff.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander, Jenna Burke

Opposed:

Comments: Two neighbors spoke in opposition to the proposal. One neighbor spoke in favor.

E. 1609 Governor Nicholls

Application: New construction of a single family residential building.

Motion: Grant conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Dwight Norton

Result: Passed

In favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Matthew Lindsay, Jenna Burke

Opposed: Calvin Alexander

Comments: One neighbor spoke in opposition to the proposal.

**III. OLD BUSINESS LANDMARK DESIGNATIONS**

A. 1109 Erato Street

Motion: Deny designation.

By: Dwight Norton

Seconded: Jenna Burke

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander, Jenna Burke

Opposed:

Comment:

The Commission took Item B out of order.

B. 1173 Magazine Street

Motion: Deny designation

By: Marlene Jaffe

Seconded: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander, Jenna Burke

Opposed:

Comment: Owner spoke against designation of her property as a landmark.

C. 1012 Brooklyn Avenue

Motion: Designate the structure.

By: Heather Szapary

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander, Jenna Burke

Opposed: Greg Hackenberg

Comment:

**IV. NEW BUSINESS LANDMARK DESIGNATION**

A. 1502 Elysian Fields Avenue

Motion: Defer action for 30 days.

By: Dwight Norton

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander, Jenna Burke Opposed:

Comment:

**V. NEW BUSINESS WORK APPLICATIONS**

A. 5401 Dauphine Street

Application: New construction of two-story 1,878 sq. ft. single family residential building. Appeal of ARC and Staff recommendation against installing visually prominent solar equipment.

Motion: Grant conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level.

By: Calvin Alexander

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander, Jenna Burke

Opposed:

**VI. OLD BUSINESS RETENTION APPLICATIONS**

A. 1131 Columbus Street

Application: Retention of dormer window.

Motion: Deny application.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Dwight Norton

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander, Jenna Burke

Opposed:

B. 1129 N. Robertson Street

Application: Retention of inappropriate windows installed without Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Deny the application.

By: Marlene Jaffe

Seconded: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander, Jenna Burke

Opposed:

Comment:

C. 324-326 Evelina St

Application: Retention of removal of 6/6, true-divided light, wood windows and installation of 9/9, surface-mounted vinyl windows on right side elevation without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Defer to February meeting.

By: Heather Szapary

Seconded: John Deveney

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander, Jenna Burke

Opposed:

D. 2834-36 Annunciation Street

Application: Retention of inappropriate security doors.

Motion: Deny application.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Dwight Norton

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander, Jenna Burke

Opposed:

E. 426-28 Bouny Street

Application: Retention of work done in deviation or without a Certificate of Appropriateness, including replacement windows larger than approved, inappropriate door and window trim, addition of overhangs at sides, installation of pane over panel doors, addition of transom windows, and installation of smooth plywood porch ceiling. (Light fixtures will be removed.)

Motion: Approve the application for retention of the inappropriate conditions as-built, provided the Applicant verifies the roof is not failing and constructs a secondary beam below the existing beam with the details to be worked out at the staff level.

By: Heather Szapary

Seconded: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander, Jenna Burke

Opposed:

**IV. NEW BUSINESS RETENTION APPLICATIONS**

A. 737 2<sup>nd</sup> Street

Application: Retention of vinyl siding installed at rear.

Motion: Deny the application for retention, but allow three (3) months to correct the violation.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Jenna Burke

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander, Jenna Burke

Opposed:

Comment:

B. 524 Delery Street

Application: Retention of wind turbines installed on roof in violation of HDLC Guidelines.

Motion: Defer matter to February meeting.

By: Calvin Alexander

Seconded: Matthew Lindsay

Result: Passed

In Favor: Unanimous

Opposed: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander, Jenna Burke

Comment:

John Deveney and Jenna Burke left the meeting.

C. 716 Delery Street

Application: Retention of work done without Certificate of Appropriateness and in deviation of HDLC Guidelines.

Motion: Defer to February meeting.

By: Calvin Alexander

Seconded: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander

Opposed:

Comment:

Jenna Burke returned to the meeting.

D. 912 Belleville Street

Application: Retention of inappropriate oval-light door installed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Deny application and allow seven months to correct violation.

By: Heather Szapary

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander, Jenna Burke

Opposed:

Comment:

E. 1317 Henriette Delille Street

Application: Retention of numerous violations.

Motion: Defer to February meeting.

By: Heather Szapary

Seconded: Dwight Norton

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander, Jenna Burke

Opposed:

Comment:

F. 1512 Constance Street

Application: Retention of (4) vinyl windows on the front of an existing residential building installed by previous owner without Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Allow retention provided when they are replaced in the future that they be replaced with Wood windows.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Dwight Norton

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander, Jenna Burke

Opposed:

Comment:

G. 1362 Constance Street

Application: Retention of AC equipment installed at front elevation of camelback.

Motion: Approve the application for retention due to the limited visibility of the equipment with the proviso that an appropriate wood screening device is installed. When the equipment is to be replaced the Commission requires that it be relocated to a less visible location that shall be approved by the HDLC.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander, Jenna Burke

Opposed:

Comment:

H. 915 Opelousas Street

Application: Retention of inappropriate iron fence installed at front property line; completion of installation of chainlink fence at side property line. Work begun without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Allow retention of the metal fence at the front property line and installation of a sliding vehicular gate, provided the shorter, interstitial pickets are removed entirely; the finials are removed from all of the pickets; and the pedestrian gate is correctly sized and detailed. Allow the retention and completion of the chainlink fence at the left side property line due to the existing predominating conditions of the block.

By: Heather Szapary

Seconded: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander, Jenna Burke

Opposed:

Comment:

I. 1370 LaHarpe Street

Application: Retention of wind turbine and the removal of ridge tiles; work done by previous owner without Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Deny application.

By: Marlene Jaffe

Seconded: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander, Jenna Burke

Opposed:

Comment:

J. 822 Valette Street

Application: Retention of removal of existing windows, closure of window openings and installation of inappropriate surface mounted windows. Work done without Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve retention of the inappropriate vinyl windows, provided the first windows on each side is recessed and appropriate wood screens installed at each of these windows, and fixed shutters with window trim are installed at the three blind openings where windows were removed entirely. Allow twelve (12) months for the corrections to be made.

By: Heather Szapary

Seconded: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander, Jenna Burke

Opposed:

Comment:

Motion: Suspend the rules

By: Matthew Lindsay

Seconded: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander, Jenna Burke

Opposed:

Comment:

Motion: Add Item K: 729 Lizardi Street to the agenda

By: Matthew Lindsay

Seconded: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, Matthew Lindsay, Calvin Alexander, Jenna Burke

Opposed:

Comment:

k. 729 Lizardi Street

Application: Retention of inappropriate installation of weatherboards and cornerboards.

Motion: Approve the retention of the reveal of the siding as installed, deny retention of the wide corner boards at the corner of the setback of the left-side of the front elevation and deny retention of the front soffit boards as installed.

By: Marlene Jaffe

Seconded: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed

Comment:

## VIII. HDLC REPORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.